

**VOLUME III
WASHINGTON, D.C. INVESTIGATION**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Part C	
Webster L. Hubbell's Billing Practices and Tax Filings	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. FINDINGS	3
III. FACTUAL SUMMARY	5
A. Webster Hubbell Violated Federal Mail Fraud and Tax Laws While a Partner with the Rose Law Firm.....	5
1. After Hubbell Was Appointed Associate Attorney General, Both Civil and Criminal Investigations of His Billing Practices and Tax Filings Commenced.....	5
2. Webster Hubbell Pleaded Guilty to Mail Fraud and Tax Evasion in December 1994	8
3. Rose's Efforts to Recover its Losses from Webster Hubbell	12
B. Before Entering into His Plea Agreement, Webster Hubbell Started a Consulting Business Concentrating on Supporters of the President.....	13
1. Hubbell's Contacts with Clinton Administration Members and Prominent Democratic Party Supporters.....	13
a. Hubbell's Contacts with Administration and Former Campaign Officials	14
b. Contact with the President and the First Lady	14
2. Meetings Were Held in the White House to Discuss Hubbell's Situation before He Resigned	15
3. Efforts to Help Webster Hubbell Find Post-Administration Employment Resulted in at Least Seventeen Consulting Agreements	17

4.	Hubbell's Consulting Agreements	21
a.	American Income Life (Bernard Rapoport).....	22
b.	C.W. Conn Industries (Carroll Wayne Conn).....	23
c.	Consumer Support and Education Fund (John Phillips).....	24
d.	Entrecorp (Ben Barnes).....	27
e.	Hong Kong China Limited/Lippo Group (James Riady).....	28
f.	John Moores.....	37
g.	Barbara Lindemann.....	38
h.	Mid-America Dairymen.....	39
i.	Nicholas Stonnington (Merrill Lynch).....	40
j.	Pacific Telesis	41
k.	Revlon (MacAndrews & Forbes).....	44
l.	SunAmerica (Eli Broad)	47
m.	Time Warner	49
n.	Truman Arnold Companies (Truman Arnold).....	50
o.	Wayne Reaud (Reaud, Morgan & Quinn)	52
p.	Sprint Corporation	52
q.	City of Los Angeles Department of Airports.....	54
C.	The Tax Prosecution of Webster Hubbell, Suzanna Hubbell, Michael Schaufele, and Charles Owen	56
1.	"Related to" Jurisdiction	58
2.	<u>U.S. v. Hubbell et al.</u> , Crim. Action No. 98-0151 (JR).....	59
a.	April 1998 Indictment.....	60
b.	Jurisdictional Issue.....	62

	c.	Act of Production Immunity Issue	63
	d.	Hubbell's June 1999 Conditional Plea Agreement	64
	e.	Supreme Court Review	65
IV.		ANALYSIS.....	66
	A.	Obstruction of Justice	67
	B.	Tax Fraud	69
V.		SUMMARY CONCLUSION.....	70

Part D
Rose Law Firm Billing Records

I.		INTRODUCTION	71
II.		FINDINGS.....	76
III.		FACTUAL SUMMARY	79
	A.	Creation and Collection of Billing Records at Rose.....	80
		1. Requests During the 1992 Campaign to Gather the Billing Records	81
		a. Computer Billing Records	81
		b. Billing Records in Remote Storage.....	82
		2. Webb Hubbell and Vince Foster Had the Billing Records in 1992.....	84
		3. Attempts to Locate Mrs. Clinton's Time Sheets	87
	B.	Transferring the Documents from Little Rock to Washington, D.C.....	88
		1. Moving Documents from the Governor's Mansion to the White House between 1993 and 1996	88
		a. Packing in Little Rock	88
		b. The White House Residence	89
		c. Unloading at the White House.....	91

d.	Moving the Files -- 1993 to 1996	93
2.	Rose Shipped Documents to the White House	95
3.	Boxes from Vincent Foster's Rose Office.....	95
4.	Documents from the Presidential Campaign	96
5.	Documents Maintained by Webster Hubbell.....	97
C.	Search and Production of Documents to the Independent Counsel.....	99
1.	Personal Records.....	99
2.	Mrs. Clinton's Rose Records.....	100
3.	Hubbell/Wright Records	100
4.	Rose Billing Records	102
D.	Huber Testified She Found the Records in Room 319A	102
1.	Denials of Responsibility.....	103
2.	Extrinsic Evidence Relating to Room 319A.....	104
a.	Access to White House Residence.....	105
b.	Renovations to Residence.....	106
c.	Evidence Relating to Mrs. Clinton's Conduct in July 1995.....	108
d.	Documents from Foster's Office	113
e.	Mrs. Clinton's Testimony about Billing Records Found in Room 319A.....	115
E.	Evidence Regarding Discovery of Rose Billing Records in the White House.....	116
1.	Carolyn Huber's Initial Discovery of Billing Records.....	117
2.	Huber's Re-Discovery and Realization of the Billing Records	119
a.	Kendall, Schuelke, and Sherburne Are Notified of the Billing Records' Discovery	120

b.	Kendall, Schuelke, and Sherburne Review Records with Huber	120
F.	The Office of the Independent Counsel Asked the FBI to Conduct Forensic Analyses of the Billing Records.....	123
1.	Fingerprint Analysis Disclosed Mrs. Clinton's and Vince Foster's Prints	124
2.	Rose Employees Hatch and Alston Explained Their Fingerprints	125
3.	Mrs. Clinton's Explanation of Her Fingerprints.....	126
G.	Billing Records Found in Foster's Attic -- July 1997	130
1.	Discovery of Second Set of Rose Billing Records Relating to Madison Guaranty and Madison Bank & Trust.....	130
a.	Comparison of Billing Records Discovered in White House with Those Discovered in Foster's Attic.....	133
b.	Mrs. Clinton's Testimony on the Billing Records in Foster's Attic	134
2.	Other Documents in Foster's Briefcase.....	135
3.	Forensic Analysis.....	139
IV.	ANALYSIS.....	139
A.	Mrs. Clinton	140
B.	Other Hypotheses.....	142
V.	SUMMARY CONCLUSIONS.....	143

Part E
The Discovery and Removal of Documents
from Vincent W. Foster Jr.'s Office

I.	INTRODUCTION	145
II.	FINDINGS.....	150
III.	FACTUAL SUMMARY	156

A.	Notification of Foster's Death	156
B.	Evidence about Tampering with Documents or Foster's Note before the July 22 Search	159
1.	White House Officials Failed to Seal the Office	161
a.	Braun and Watkins.....	161
b.	White House Discussions	163
2.	The Confidential Witness	165
3.	Thomasson/Nussbaum/Williams in Foster's Office.....	166
a.	Discussion at Foster's House.....	166
b.	Gail Kennedy's Account of the Night of July 20	167
c.	The White House	169
i.	Patsy Thomasson	171
ii.	Bernard Nussbaum.....	175
iii.	Maggie Williams.....	177
iv.	Henry O'Neill.....	180
v.	Other Evidence about O'Neill and Williams.....	188
vi.	Telephone Conversations the Evening of July 20 and Early Morning Hours of July 21	189
4.	The Trash from Foster's Office	193
5.	Betsy Pond Entered Foster's Office on the Morning of July 21.....	195
6.	Craig Livingstone's Activities on July 21	195
C.	The Procedure for Searching Foster's Office	200
1.	White House Meeting on July 21.....	201
2.	Morning Meeting on July 22: Department of Justice Attorneys Object to Method of Search	207
D.	Events between the Meeting on July 21 and the Search on July 22	210

1.	Telephone Conversations before the July 22 Morning Meeting of Nussbaum, Margolis, and Adams	211
a.	July 21: Evening Discussions	213
b.	July 22: Telephone Traffic.....	216
i.	Bernard Nussbaum.....	218
ii.	Susan Thomases.....	220
iii.	Maggie Williams.....	225
iv.	Hillary Rodham Clinton.....	227
2.	More Discussions at the White House	228
3.	Susan Thomases's Multiple Phone Calls to the White House on July 22.....	232
E.	The Search of Foster's Office.....	235
F.	Handling of Foster's Documents after the Search.....	238
1.	Overview.....	238
2.	Collecting the Clintons' Personal Documents.....	240
3.	The Clintons' Personal Files Go to the Residence	244
4.	Conflicting Testimony over Whether One or Two Boxes of Documents Were Taken to the White House Residence	253
a.	Thomas Castleton.....	253
b.	Bernard Nussbaum.....	254
c.	Deborah Gorham.....	255
d.	Linda Tripp	256
5.	The Boxes Taken to the Foster Family Attorneys at Swidler & Berlin	257
6.	The Box Seen by the White House Plumbing Foreman	257
7.	The Return of a White House Renovation File.....	259
a.	Nussbaum's Testimony	260

b.	Williams's Testimony	264
c.	Neuwirth's Testimony	266
d.	The Yellow Envelope	268
e.	Fingerprint Analysis.....	270
f.	The File Returned by Swidler & Berlin.....	270
G.	The Foster Funeral: Discussions of Documents	271
H.	The Weekend	272
I.	The Foster Note.....	277
1.	Discovery	277
2.	Handling of Briefcase before Discovery of Note	281
3.	Disclosure of Note to Law Enforcement	289
J.	The Transfer of Documents to Williams & Connolly	293
1.	Monday, July 26, 1993.....	293
2.	Tuesday, July 27, 1993	295
3.	Susan Thomases's Memory.....	302
IV.	ANALYSIS.....	304
A.	Maggie Williams's Testimony about Her Removal of Documents from Foster's Office on the Night of His Death.....	305
B.	Bernard Nussbaum's Search of Foster's Office.....	307
C.	Susan Thomases's Testimony to this Office and Congress about Her Discussions with Mrs. Clinton and Bearnard Nussbaum about the Search.....	309
D.	Maggie Williams's and Mrs. Clinton's Testimony about the Removal of the Clintons' Personal Documents from Foster's Office and Their Placement in the White House Residence	310
E.	The Clintons' Personal Documents Removed from Foster's Office and the Testimony of Mrs. Clinton, Maggie Williams, and Robert Barnett.....	312

F.	Craig Livingstone's Testimony about His Activities on the Morning of July 21, 1993.....	313
V.	SUMMARY CONCLUSIONS.....	315
APPENDIX 1- PLEA AGREEMENT, <u>UNITED STATES V. WEBSTER HUBBELL</u> , CASE NO. LR-CR-94-241 (DECEMBER 6, 1994) AND PLEA AGREEMENT AND PLEA ALLOCUTION, <u>UNITED STATES V. WEBSTER L. HUBBELL</u> , CASE NOS. 98-0394, 98-0151 (JUNE 30, 1999)		
APPENDIX 2 - CLIENTS AND CLIENT-GENERATED INCOME FOR WEBSTER L. HUBBELL (1994-1995)		
APPENDIX 3 - THE WHITE HOUSE'S NON-COMPLIANCE WITH SUBPOENA REQUESTS FOR ELECTRONICALLY MAINTAINED DOCUMENTS		
I.	INTRODUCTION	i
II.	THE INDEPENDENT COUNSEL LEARNED IN FEBRUARY 2000 THAT ELECTRONIC RECORDS FROM THE BEGINNING OF THE ADMINISTRATION MAY NOT HAVE BEEN SEARCHED IN COMPLIANCE WITH LAWFULLY ISSUED SUBPOENAS.....	i
A.	Reconstructed E-Mails for the Time Period of January 1993 through July 1994	iii
B.	The MAIL2 and User-D Problems That Prevented Incoming E-Mails from Being Records Managed	vi
1.	The White House Counsel's Office Performed a "Test" Search and Incorrectly Concluded There Was Not a Compliance Problem.....	viii
2.	Backup Tapes of E-Mails.....	xiii
C.	Contrary to White House Assertions That All Responsive Documents Have Been Produced, the Independent Counsel Learned That Hard Drives of Departed Employees Have Not Been Searched.....	xvi
D.	E-Mail from the WAVES System, the Quorum System and the Executive Residence	xviii
1.	Executive Residence E-Mail.....	xviii
2.	WAVES System.....	xix

3.	Quorum System	xix
III.	ALLEGATIONS OF THREATS MADE TO NORTHROP GRUMMAN EMPLOYEES TO CONCEAL THE E-MAIL PROBLEM	xix
A.	Background on Allegations of Threats	xx
B.	Callahan Refuted Allegations of Threats	xxiv
IV.	THE WHITE HOUSE'S FAILURE TO PRODUCE ALL RELEVANT DOCUMENTS CONCERNING VINCENT FOSTER	xxvi
A.	The Unexplained Appearance and Disappearance of Vincent Foster's and Deborah Gorham's Hard Drives and Backup Tapes	xxvi
B.	Missing Files from Steven Neuwirth's List of Documents in Foster's Office	xxxvii
V.	CONCLUSION	xxxviii